Reverse-Engineering Censorship in China\textsuperscript{1}

Gary King\textsuperscript{2}

Institute for Quantitative Social Science
Harvard University

(Talk at Capital One, 10/15/2014)

\textsuperscript{1}Based on joint work with Jennifer Pan and Margaret Roberts
\textsuperscript{2}GaryKing.org
Papers

○ An Observational Study:

○ Experimental and Participatory Studies:
  Reverse Engineering Chinese Censorship (Science, 2014)

○ Methods:
  - General Purpose Computer-Assisted Clustering and Conceptualization (PNAS, 2011)
  - A Method of Automated Nonparametric Content Analysis for Social Science (AJPS, 2010)
  - Computer-Assisted Keyword and Document Set Discovery from Unstructured Text

Copies at GaryKing.org
Chinese Censorship

The largest selective suppression of human expression in history: implemented manually (within a few hours of posting), by ≈200,000 workers, located in government and inside social media firms. A huge censorship organization: (obviously) designed to suppress information (paradoxically) very revealing about the goals, intentions, and actions of the Chinese leadership.
Chinese Censorship

- The largest selective suppression of human expression in history:
Chinese Censorship

- The largest selective suppression of human expression in history:
  - implemented *manually* (within a few hours of posting),
Chinese Censorship

- The largest selective suppression of human expression in history:
  - implemented *manually* (within a few hours of posting),
  - by $\approx 200,000$ workers,
Chinese Censorship

- The largest selective suppression of human expression in history:
  - implemented *manually* (within a few hours of posting),
  - by ≈ 200,000 workers,
  - located in government and inside social media firms
Chinese Censorship

- The largest selective suppression of human expression in history:
  - implemented *manually* (within a few hours of posting),
  - by $\approx 200,000$ workers,
  - located in government and inside social media firms

- A huge censorship organization:
Chinese Censorship

- The largest selective suppression of human expression in history:
  - implemented *manually* (within a few hours of posting),
  - by ≈ 200,000 workers,
  - located in government and inside social media firms

- A huge censorship organization:
  - (obviously) designed to suppress information
Chinese Censorship

- The largest selective suppression of human expression in history:
  - implemented *manually* (within a few hours of posting),
  - by \( \approx 200,000 \) workers,
  - located in government and inside social media firms

- A huge censorship organization:
  - (obviously) designed to suppress information
  - (paradoxically) very revealing about the goals, intentions, and actions of the Chinese leadership
Chinese Social Media: Fractured over 1,400+ sites
Chinese Social Media: Fractured over 1,400+ sites

(Plus 59% from Sina Blog)
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

1. Stop collective action

Implications: Social Media is Actionable!

Chinese leaders: measure criticism: to judge local officials
censor: to stop events with collective action potential

Thus, we can use criticism & censorship to predict:
- Officials in trouble, likely to be replaced
- Policies that generate dissent (& interest of leaders)
- Government action outside the Internet
- Dissidents to be arrested; peace treaties to sign; emerging scandals
- Disagreements between central and local leaders

⇝

A big prize, but payable only if we have the goals right
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- Everyone knows the Goal:
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- **Everyone knows the Goal:**
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- Everyone knows the Goal:
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies Wrong
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- Everyone knows the Goal:
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies *Wrong*

- What Could be the Goal?
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- Everyone knows the Goal:
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies \textit{Wrong}

- What Could be the Goal?
  1. Stop criticism of the state
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- **Everyone knows the Goal:**
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies *Wrong*

- **What Could be the Goal?**
  1. Stop criticism of the state
  2. Stop collective action

**Implications:** Social Media is Actionable!

Chinese leaders:
- measure criticism: to judge local officials
- censor: to stop events with collective action potential

Thus, we can use criticism & censorship to predict:
- Officials in trouble, likely to be replaced
- Policies that generate dissent (& interest of leaders)
- Government action outside the Internet
- Dissidents to be arrested; peace treaties to sign; emerging scandals

⇝

A big prize, but payable only if we have the goals right
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- **Everyone knows the Goal:**
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies *Wrong*

- **What Could be the Goal?**

  1. Stop criticism of the state *Wrong*
  2. Stop collective action

  Implications: Social Media is Actionable!

  - Chinese leaders: measure criticism: to judge local officials
censor: to stop events with collective action potential
  
  Thus, we can use criticism & censorship to predict:
  
  - Officials in trouble, likely to be replaced
  - Policies that generate dissent (& interest of leaders)
  - Government action outside the Internet
  - Dissidents to be arrested; peace treaties to sign; emerging scandals
  
  ⇝ A big prize, but payable only if we have the goals right
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- **Everyone knows the Goal:**
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies *Wrong*

- **What Could be the Goal?**
  1. **Stop criticism of the state** *Wrong*
  2. **Stop collective action** *Right*

**Implications:** Social Media is Actionable!

- Chinese leaders: measure criticism: to judge local officials
censor: to stop events with collective action potential

Thus, we can use criticism & censorship to predict:
- Officials in trouble, likely to be replaced
- Policies that generate dissent (& interest of leaders)
- Government action outside the Internet
- Dissidents to be arrested; peace treaties to sign; emerging scandals
- Disagreements between central and local leaders

⇝ A big prize, but payable only if we have the goals right

6/28
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- Everyone knows the Goal:
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies **Wrong**

- What Could be the Goal?
  1. Stop criticism of the state **Wrong**
  2. Stop collective action **Right**

- Implications: Social Media is Actionable!
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- Everyone knows the Goal:
  - Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies **Wrong**

- What Could be the Goal?
  1. Stop criticism of the state **Wrong**
  2. Stop collective action **Right**

- Implications: Social Media is Actionable!
  - Chinese leaders:
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- Everyone knows the Goal:
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies *Wrong*

- What Could be the Goal?
  1. Stop criticism of the state *Wrong*
  2. Stop collective action *Right*

- Implications: Social Media is Actionable!
  - Chinese leaders:
    - measure criticism: to judge local officials
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- Everyone knows the Goal:
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies *Wrong*

- What Could be the Goal?
  1. Stop criticism of the state *Wrong*
  2. Stop collective action *Right*

- Implications: Social Media is Actionable!
  - Chinese leaders:
    - measure criticism: to judge local officials
    - censor: to stop events with collective action potential
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- **Everyone knows the Goal:**
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies *Wrong*

- **What Could be the Goal?**
  1. Stop criticism of the state *Wrong*
  2. Stop collective action *Right*

- **Implications: Social Media is Actionable!**
  - Chinese leaders:
    - measure criticism: to judge local officials
    - censor: to stop events with collective action potential
  - Thus, we can use criticism & censorship to predict:
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- **Everyone knows the Goal:**
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies *Wrong*

- **What Could be the Goal?**
  1. Stop criticism of the state *Wrong*
  2. Stop collective action *Right*

- **Implications: Social Media is Actionable!**
  - Chinese leaders:
    - measure criticism: to judge local officials
    - censor: to stop events with collective action potential
  - Thus, we can use criticism & censorship to predict:
    - Officials in trouble, likely to be replaced
Everyone knows the Goal:
Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies **Wrong**

What Could be the Goal?
1. Stop criticism of the state **Wrong**
2. Stop collective action **Right**

Implications: Social Media is Actionable!
- Chinese leaders:
  - measure criticism: to judge local officials
  - censor: to stop events with collective action potential
- Thus, we can use criticism & censorship to predict:
  - Officials in trouble, likely to be replaced
  - Policies that generate dissent (& interest of leaders)
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- **Everyone knows the Goal:**
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies *Wrong*

- **What Could be the Goal?**
  1. Stop criticism of the state *Wrong*
  2. Stop collective action *Right*

- **Implications: Social Media is Actionable!**
  - Chinese leaders:
    - measure criticism: to judge local officials
    - censor: to stop events with collective action potential
  - Thus, we can use criticism & censorship to predict:
    - Officials in trouble, likely to be replaced
    - Policies that generate dissent (& interest of leaders)
    - Government action outside the Internet
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- **Everyone knows the Goal:**
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies *Wrong*

- **What Could be the Goal?**
  1. Stop criticism of the state *Wrong*
  2. Stop collective action *Right*

- **Implications: Social Media is Actionable!**
  - Chinese leaders:
    - measure criticism: to judge local officials
    - censor: to stop events with collective action potential
  - Thus, we can use criticism & censorship to predict:
    - Officials in trouble, likely to be replaced
    - Policies that generate dissent (& interest of leaders)
    - Government action outside the Internet
    - Dissidents to be arrested; peace treaties to sign; emerging scandals
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- **Everyone knows the Goal:**
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies *Wrong*

- **What Could be the Goal?**
  1. Stop criticism of the state *Wrong*
  2. Stop collective action *Right*

- **Implications: Social Media is Actionable!**
  - Chinese leaders:
    - measure criticism: to judge local officials
    - censor: to stop events with collective action potential
  - Thus, we can use criticism & censorship to predict:
    - Officials in trouble, likely to be replaced
    - Policies that generate dissent (& interest of leaders)
    - Government action outside the Internet
    - Dissidents to be arrested; peace treaties to sign; emerging scandals
    - Disagreements between central and local leaders
The Goals of Censorship make Social Media Actionable

- **Everyone knows the Goal:**
  Stop criticism, protest, & collective action about the state, its leaders, and their policies *Wrong*

- **What Could be the Goal?**
  1. Stop criticism of the state *Wrong*
  2. Stop collective action *Right*

- **Implications: Social Media is Actionable!**
  - Chinese leaders:
    - measure criticism: to judge local officials
    - censor: to stop events with collective action potential
  - Thus, we can use criticism & censorship to predict:
    - Officials in trouble, likely to be replaced
    - Policies that generate dissent (& interest of leaders)
    - Government action outside the Internet
    - Dissidents to be arrested; peace treaties to sign; emerging scandals
    - Disagreements between central and local leaders

  *→ A big prize, but payable only if we have the goals right*
Our Observational Research Design: 5 Steps

1. Monitor 85 content areas over 6 months
2. Download each social media post, the instant it appears
3. Revisit each later to check if it was censored (carefully, from computers all over the world)
4. Repeat 11,382,221 times
5. Analyze with new methods of computer-assisted text analysis
Our Observational Research Design: 5 Steps

1. **Monitor** 85 content areas over 6 months
Our Observational Research Design: 5 Steps

1. **Monitor** 85 content areas over 6 months
2. **Download** each social media post, the instant it appears
Our Observational Research Design: 5 Steps

1. **Monitor** 85 content areas over 6 months
2. **Download** each social media post, the instant it appears
3. **Revisit** each later to check if it was censored
   (carefully, from computers all over the world)
Our Observational Research Design: 5 Steps

1. Monitor 85 content areas over 6 months
2. Download each social media post, the instant it appears
3. Revisit each later to check if it was censored (carefully, from computers all over the world)
4. Repeat 11,382,221 times
Our Observational Research Design: 5 Steps

1. Monitor 85 content areas over 6 months
2. Download each social media post, the instant it appears
3. Revisit each later to check if it was censored (carefully, from computers all over the world)
4. Repeat 11,382,221 times
5. Analyze with new methods of computer-assisted text analysis
Censorship is not Ambiguous: Example Error Page

Sorry, the host you were looking for does not exist, has been deleted, or is being investigated
Censorship is not Ambiguous: BBS Error Page

The page you requested is temporarily down. How about you go look at another page.

Jingjing, one of China's cartoon internet police
The Censors are Fast; Our Automated Methods are Faster
The Censors are Fast; Our Automated Methods are Faster

Example: Shanghai Subway Crash
The Censors are Fast; Our Automated Methods are Faster

Example: Shanghai Subway Crash
Post Volume & Censorship are “Bursty”
Post Volume & Censorship are “Bursty”

Collective Support for Environmental Lottery

Count Published
Count Censored
Post Volume & Censorship are “Bursty”

- Found 87 volume bursts in our 85 topic areas
Post Volume & Censorship are “Bursty”

- Found 87 volume bursts in our 85 topic areas
- Identified real world event associated with each burst
Post Volume & Censorship are “Bursty”

- Found 87 volume bursts in our 85 topic areas
- Identified real world event associated with each burst

Our hypothesis: The government censors all posts in volume bursts associated with events with collective action potential (regardless of how critical or supportive of the state)
Post Volume & Censorship are “Bursty”

- Found **87 volume bursts** in our 85 topic areas
- Identified **real world event** associated with each burst

Our hypothesis: The government censors **all posts** in volume bursts associated with events with collective action potential (regardless of how critical or supportive of the state)
Post Volume & Censorship are “Bursty”

- Found 87 volume bursts in our 85 topic areas
- Identified real world event associated with each burst

Our hypothesis: The government censors all posts in volume bursts associated with events with collective action potential (regardless of how critical or supportive of the state)
Post Volume & Censorship are “Bursty”

- Found 87 volume bursts in our 85 topic areas
- Identified real world event associated with each burst

Our hypothesis: The government censors all posts in volume bursts associated with events with collective action potential (regardless of how critical or supportive of the state)
Post Volume & Censorship are “Bursty”

- Found 87 volume bursts in our 85 topic areas
- Identified real world event associated with each burst

Our hypothesis: The government censors all posts in volume bursts associated with events with collective action potential (regardless of how critical or supportive of the state)
Observational Test 1: Post Volume

Begin with our 87 volume bursts in 85 topics areas. For each burst, calculate change in % censorship inside to outside each volume burst within topic areas—censorship magnitude. If the goal of censorship is to stop collective action, we expect:

1. On average, % censored should increase during volume bursts.
2. Some bursts (associated with politically relevant events) should have much higher censorship.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Censorship Magnitude</th>
<th>Density</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-0.2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12/28
Observational Test 1: Post Volume

Begin with our 87 volume bursts in 85 topics areas
Observational Test 1: Post Volume

- Begin with our 87 volume bursts in 85 topics areas
- For each burst, calculate change in % censorship inside to outside each volume burst within topic areas – censorship magnitude
Observational Test 1: Post Volume

- Begin with our **87 volume bursts** in 85 topics areas
- For each burst, calculate change in % censorship inside to outside each volume burst within topic areas – **censorship magnitude**
- If goal of censorship is to stop collective action, **we expect:**
Observational Test 1: Post Volume

- Begin with our 87 volume bursts in 85 topics areas
- For each burst, calculate change in % censorship inside to outside each volume burst within topic areas – censorship magnitude
- If goal of censorship is to stop collective action, we expect:

1. On average, % censored should increase during volume bursts
Observational Test 1: Post Volume

- Begin with our 87 volume bursts in 85 topics areas
- For each burst, calculate change in % censorship inside to outside each volume burst within topic areas – censorship magnitude
- If goal of censorship is to stop collective action, we expect:

1. On average, % censored should increase during volume bursts
2. Some bursts (associated with politically relevant events) should have much higher censorship
Observational Test 1: Post Volume

- Begin with our 87 volume bursts in 85 topics areas
- For each burst, calculate change in % censorship inside to outside each volume burst within topic areas – censorship magnitude
- If goal of censorship is to stop collective action, we expect:

1. On average, % censored should increase during volume bursts
2. Some bursts (associated with politically relevant events) should have much higher censorship
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. protest or organized crowd formation outside the Internet
2. individuals who have organized or incited collective action on the ground in the past;
3. topics related to nationalism or nationalist sentiment that have incited protest or collective action in the past.

(Inter-coder reliability: 98.9%)
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. Collective Action Potential
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. Collective Action Potential
   - protest or organized crowd formation outside the Internet
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. Collective Action Potential
   - protest or organized crowd formation outside the Internet
   - individuals who have organized or incited collective action on the ground in the past;
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. Collective Action Potential
   - protest or organized crowd formation outside the Internet
   - individuals who have organized or incited collective action on the ground in the past;
   - topics related to nationalism or nationalist sentiment that have incited protest or collective action in the past.
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. **Collective Action Potential**
   - protest or organized crowd formation outside the Internet
   - individuals who have organized or incited collective action on the ground in the past;
   - topics related to nationalism or nationalist sentiment that have incited protest or collective action in the past.
   - (Inter-coder reliability: 98.9%)
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. Collective Action Potential
   - protest or organized crowd formation outside the Internet
   - individuals who have organized or incited collective action on the ground in the past;
   - topics related to nationalism or nationalist sentiment that have incited protest or collective action in the past.
   - (Inter-coder reliability: 98.9%

2. Criticism of censors
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. Collective Action Potential
   - protest or organized crowd formation outside the Internet
   - individuals who have organized or incited collective action on the ground in the past;
   - topics related to nationalism or nationalist sentiment that have incited protest or collective action in the past.
   - (Inter-coder reliability: 98.9%)

2. Criticism of censors

3. Pornography
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. Collective Action Potential
   - protest or organized crowd formation outside the Internet
   - individuals who have organized or incited collective action on the ground in the past;
   - topics related to nationalism or nationalist sentiment that have incited protest or collective action in the past.
   - (Inter-coder reliability: 98.9%)

2. Criticism of censors

3. Pornography

4. (Other) News
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. Collective Action Potential
   - protest or organized crowd formation outside the Internet
   - individuals who have organized or incited collective action on the ground in the past;
   - topics related to nationalism or nationalist sentiment that have incited protest or collective action in the past.
   - (Inter-coder reliability: 98.9%)

2. Criticism of censors

3. Pornography

4. (Other) News

5. Government Policies
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. **Collective Action Potential**
   - protest or organized crowd formation outside the Internet
   - individuals who have organized or incited collective action on the ground in the past;
   - topics related to nationalism or nationalist sentiment that have incited protest or collective action in the past.
   - (Inter-coder reliability: 98.9%)

2. Criticism of censors

3. Pornography

4. (Other) News

5. Government Policies
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. Collective Action Potential
   - protest or organized crowd formation outside the Internet
   - individuals who have organized or incited collective action on the ground in the past;
   - topics related to nationalism or nationalist sentiment that have incited protest or collective action in the past.
   - (Inter-coder reliability: 98.9%)

2. Criticism of censors

3. Pornography

4. (Other) News

5. Government Policies
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. **Collective Action Potential**
   - protest or organized crowd formation outside the Internet
   - individuals who have organized or incited collective action on the ground in the past;
   - topics related to nationalism or nationalist sentiment that have incited protest or collective action in the past.
   - (Inter-coder reliability: 98.9%)

2. **Criticism of Censors**

3. **Pornography**

4. **(Other) News**

5. **Government Policies**
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. **Collective Action Potential**
   - protest or organized crowd formation outside the Internet
   - individuals who have organized or incited collective action on the ground in the past;
   - topics related to nationalism or nationalist sentiment that have incited protest or collective action in the past.
   - (Inter-coder reliability: 98.9%)

2. **Criticism of censors**

3. **Pornography**

4. **(Other) News**

5. **Government Policies**
Classification of Events Generating the Bursts

Event classification (each category can be +, −, or neutral comments about the state)

1. **Collective Action Potential**
   - protest or organized crowd formation outside the Internet
   - individuals who have organized or incited collective action on the ground in the past;
   - topics related to nationalism or nationalist sentiment that have incited protest or collective action in the past.
   - (Inter-coder reliability: 98.9%)

2. **Criticism of censors**

3. **Pornography**

4. **(Other) News**

5. **Government Policies**
What Types of Events Are Censored?
What Types of Events Are Censored?

Protests in Inner Mongolia
Pornography Disguised as News
Baidu Copyright Lawsuit
Zengcheng Protests
Pornography Mentioning Popular Book
Ai Weiwei Arrested
Collective Anger At Lead Poisoning in Jiangsu
Google is Hacked
Localized Advocacy for Environment Lottery
Fuzhou Bombing
Students Throw Shoes at Fang BinXing
Rush to Buy Salt After Earthquake
New Laws on Fifty Cent Party
U.S. Military Intervention in Libya
Food Prices Rise
Education Reform for Migrant Children
Popular Video Game Released
Indoor Smoking Ban Takes Effect
News About Iran Nuclear Program
Jon Hunstman Steps Down as Ambassador to China
Gov't Increases Power Prices
China Puts Nuclear Program on Hold
Chinese Solar Company Announces Earnings
EPA Issues New Rules on Lead
Disney Announced Theme Park
Popular Book Published in Audio Format

Censorship Magnitude
-0.2 0 0.1 0.3 0.5 0.7

Policies
News

Collective Action
Criticism of Censors
Pornography
Censoring Collective Action: Riots in Zengcheng

![Graph showing count of published and censored riots in Zengcheng over Jan to Jul.]
Censoring Collective Action: Ai Weiwei’s Arrest

[Graph showing the count of published and censored articles related to Ai Weiwei's arrest, with a peak in April]

Ai Weiwei arrested
Low Censorship on Policy: One Child

Speculation of Policy Reversal at NPC

Count Published

Count Censored

Jan Feb Mar Apr May Jun Jul
Low Censorship on News: Power Prices

Power shortages
Gov't raises power prices to curb demand
“ReadMe” Algorithm Validated in Chinese
“ReadMe” Algorithm Validated in Chinese

Example: Labor Strikes, 2010 (Training set: 100; Test set: 900)
“ReadMe” Algorithm Validated in Chinese

Example: Labor Strikes, 2010 (Training set: 100; Test set: 900)
“ReadMe” Algorithm Validated in Chinese

Example: Labor Strikes, 2010 (Training set: 100; Test set: 900)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percent Censored</th>
<th>Criticize</th>
<th>Support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>One Child Policy</td>
<td>Corruption Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>Food Prices Rise</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Uncensored: Non-Collective Action Posts

Regardless of whether Supportive or Critical
Uncensored: Non-Collective Action Posts
Regardless of whether Supportive or Critical

One Child Policy
Corruption Policy
Food Prices Rise

Percent Censored
0.0 0.2 0.4 0.6 0.8 1.0
Criticize Support Criticize Support Criticize Support
Censored: Collective Action Posts
Censored: Collective Action Posts
Regardless of whether Supportive or Critical
Censored: Collective Action Posts

Regardless of whether Supportive or Critical

![Graph showing percent censored for different events: Ai Weiwei, Fuzhou Bombing, and Inner Mongolia. The x-axis represents categories of criticism和支持, and the y-axis represents percent censored. The data points indicate the censored percentage for each category, with error bars showing variability.](image-url)
Randomized Experiment (for causal inferences)

Selected 100 top social media sites (∼87% of blogs, >500M Users, geographically diverse)
Created 2 accounts on each (from inside China all over the country)
Wrote 1,200 unique social media posts (CA/not CA, Pro/Anti)
Submitted posts randomly assigned to type
Checked on censorship (from computers in many countries)

Participatory Study (for descriptive inferences)

Current method of learning how they censor: ask (carefully!)
Our goal: change our sources’ incentives
Procedure: create our own social media website in China
Bought URL; contracted with firms for servers & software; posted and censored ourselves
To learn: we tried every software option, read the documentation, and called customer support(!)
Additional Research Designs

1. Randomized Experiment (for causal inferences)

   - Selected 100 top social media sites (\sim 87\% of blogs, > 500M Users, geographically diverse)
   - Created 2 accounts on each (from inside China all over the country)
   - Wrote 1,200 unique social media posts (CA/not CA, Pro/Anti)
   - Submitted posts randomly assigned to type
   - Checked on censorship (from computers in many countries)

2. Participatory Study (for descriptive inferences)

   - Current method of learning how they censor: ask (carefully!)
   - Our goal: change our sources' incentives
   - Procedure: create our own social media website in China
     - Bought URL; contracted with firms for servers & software; posted and censored ourselves
     - To learn: we tried every software option, read the documentation, and called customer support(!)
Additional Research Designs

1. Randomized Experiment (for causal inferences)

2. Participatory Study (for descriptive inferences)
Additional Research Designs

1 Randomized Experiment (for causal inferences)
   - Selected 100 top social media sites (~87% of blogs, >500M Users, geographically diverse)

2 Participatory Study (for descriptive inferences)
Additional Research Designs

1. Randomized Experiment (for causal inferences)
   - Selected 100 top social media sites (~87% of blogs, >500M Users, geographically diverse)
   - Created 2 accounts on each (from inside China all over the country)

2. Participatory Study (for descriptive inferences)
Additional Research Designs

1. Randomized Experiment (for causal inferences)
   - Selected 100 top social media sites (≈87% of blogs, >500M Users, geographically diverse)
   - Created 2 accounts on each (from inside China all over the country)
   - Wrote 1,200 unique social media posts (CA/not CA, Pro/Anti)

2. Participatory Study (for descriptive inferences)

   Current method of learning how they censor: ask (carefully!)
   Our goal: change our sources' incentives
   Procedure: create our own social media website in China
   Bought URL; contracted with firms for servers & software; posted and censored ourselves
   To learn: we tried every software option, read the documentation, and called customer support(!)
Additional Research Designs

1. Randomized Experiment (for causal inferences)
   - Selected 100 top social media sites (∼87% of blogs, >500M Users, geographically diverse)
   - Created 2 accounts on each (from inside China all over the country)
   - Wrote 1,200 unique social media posts (CA/not CA, Pro/Anti)
   - Submitted posts randomly assigned to type

2. Participatory Study (for descriptive inferences)
Additional Research Designs

1. Randomized Experiment (for causal inferences)
   - Selected 100 top social media sites (~87% of blogs, >500M Users, geographically diverse)
   - Created 2 accounts on each (from inside China all over the country)
   - Wrote 1,200 unique social media posts (CA/not CA, Pro/Anti)
   - Submitted posts randomly assigned to type
   - Checked on censorship (from computers in many countries)

2. Participatory Study (for descriptive inferences)
Additional Research Designs

1. **Randomized Experiment (for causal inferences)**
   - Selected 100 top social media sites (~87% of blogs, >500M Users, geographically diverse)
   - Created 2 accounts on each (from inside China all over the country)
   - Wrote 1,200 *unique* social media posts (CA/not CA, Pro/Anti)
   - Submitted posts randomly assigned to type
   - Checked on censorship (from computers in many countries)

2. **Participatory Study (for descriptive inferences)**
   - Current method of learning how they censor: ask (carefully!)
Additional Research Designs

1 Randomized Experiment (for causal inferences)
   - Selected 100 top social media sites (~87% of blogs, >500M Users, geographically diverse)
   - Created 2 accounts on each (from inside China all over the country)
   - Wrote 1,200 unique social media posts (CA/not CA, Pro/Anti)
   - Submitted posts randomly assigned to type
   - Checked on censorship (from computers in many countries)

2 Participatory Study (for descriptive inferences)
   - Current method of learning how they censor: ask (carefully!)
   - Our goal: change our sources’ incentives
**Randomized Experiment (for causal inferences)**
- Selected 100 top social media sites (~87% of blogs, >500M Users, geographically diverse)
- Created 2 accounts on each (from inside China all over the country)
- Wrote 1,200 *unique* social media posts (CA/not CA, Pro/Anti)
- Submitted posts randomly assigned to type
- Checked on censorship (from computers in many countries)

**Participatory Study (for descriptive inferences)**
- Current method of learning how they censor: ask (carefully!)
- Our goal: change our sources’ incentives
- Procedure: create our own social media website in China
Additional Research Designs

1 Randomized Experiment (for causal inferences)
   - Selected 100 top social media sites (~87% of blogs, >500M Users, geographically diverse)
   - Created 2 accounts on each (from inside China all over the country)
   - Wrote 1,200 unique social media posts (CA/not CA, Pro/Anti)
   - Submitted posts randomly assigned to type
   - Checked on censorship (from computers in many countries)

2 Participatory Study (for descriptive inferences)
   - Current method of learning how they censor: ask (carefully!)
   - Our goal: change our sources’ incentives
   - Procedure: create our own social media website in China
   - Bought URL; contracted with firms for servers & software; posted and censored ourselves
Additional Research Designs

1. Randomized Experiment (for causal inferences)
   - Selected 100 top social media sites (~87% of blogs, >500M Users, geographically diverse)
   - Created 2 accounts on each (from inside China all over the country)
   - Wrote 1,200 unique social media posts (CA/not CA, Pro/Anti)
   - Submitted posts randomly assigned to type
   - Checked on censorship (from computers in many countries)

2. Participatory Study (for descriptive inferences)
   - Current method of learning how they censor: ask (carefully!)
   - Our goal: change our sources’ incentives
   - Procedure: create our own social media website in China
   - Bought URL; contracted with firms for servers & software; posted and censored ourselves
   - To learn: we tried every software option, read the documentation, and called customer support(!)
Mechanisms of Censorship
Mechanisms of Censorship

- Submit text for posting
  - Immediately held for review before publication
  - Post is published after review
  - Post is removed (within 24 hours)
  - Post remains online

- Publish immediately
  - Post is published after review
  - Post is removed (within 24 hours)
  - Post remains online

- Publish immediately
  - Post is removed (within 24 hours)
  - Post remains online

- Publish immediately
  - Post is removed (within 24 hours)
  - Post remains online

- Publish immediately
  - Post is removed (within 24 hours)
  - Post remains online

- Publish immediately
  - Post is removed (within 24 hours)
  - Post remains online

- Publish immediately
  - Post is removed (within 24 hours)
  - Post remains online

- Publish immediately
  - Post is removed (within 24 hours)
  - Post remains online

- Publish immediately
  - Post is removed (within 24 hours)
  - Post remains online

- Publish immediately
  - Post is removed (within 24 hours)
  - Post remains online

- Publish immediately
  - Post is removed (within 24 hours)
  - Post remains online

- Publish immediately
  - Post is removed (within 24 hours)
  - Post remains online

- Publish immediately
  - Post is removed (within 24 hours)
  - Post remains online
Mechanisms of Censorship

- Submit text for posting
  - Immediately held for review before publication
    - Administrator has set up review for new topics, your post will be shown after it has passed review.
- Publish immediately
  - Post remains online
    - The government goes on about anti-corruption everyday, but is it doing anything? Today, it’s Guo Yongxiang from Sichuan... All officials are corrupt, it’s only those who have offended someone that are investigated...
- Post is removed (within 24 hours)
  - Sorry, the host you were looking for does not exist, has been deleted, or is being investigated
  - By 2020 China will have 30 million bare branches (extra men), this is a critical situation. Behind it is the fact that every year more boys than girls are born, which is due to the one-child policy. Over the years, the one-child policy has created many social problems...
- Post deleted during review
  - (Post reviewed then deleted)
- Account blocked
  - You have been silenced by the administrator, the type of silence is forever!
Mechanisms of Censorship

Submit text for posting

Post is published after review

Administrator has set up review for new topics, your post will be shown after it has passed review.

Post deleted during review

(Post reviewed then deleted)

Post remains online

The government goes on about anti-corruption everyday, but is it doing anything? Today, it’s Guo Yongxiang from Sichuan…All officials are corrupt, it’s only those who have offended someone that are investigated...

Post is removed (within 24 hours)

Sorry, the host you were looking for does not exist, has been deleted, or is being investigated.

Publish immediately

Immediately held for review before publication

By 2020 China will have 30 million bare branches (extra men), this is a critical situation. Behind it is the fact that every year more boys than girls are born, which is due to the one-child policy. Over the years, the one-child policy has created many social problems...

Account blocked

You have been silenced by the administrator, the type of silence is forever!

64% of websites review some content

40% of all submissions reviewed

Obsev-vational study
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect

Censorship Difference (Pro − Anti)
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect

Censorship Difference (Pro − Anti)

Panxu Protest
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect

Censorship Difference (Pro − Anti)

Panxu Protest

−0.5 0.0 0.5 1.0
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect

Censorship Difference (Pro − Anti)

Panxu Protest

Tibetan Self-Immolations
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect

Censorship Difference (Pro − Anti)

Panxu Protest
Ai Weiwei Album
Tibetan Self-Immolations
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect

Censorship Difference (Pro - Anti)

Panxu Protest
Tibetan Self-Immolations
Ai Weiwei Album
Protests in Xinjiang
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect

Censorship Difference (Pro − Anti)

-0.5 0.0 0.5 1.0

Panxu Protest

Tibetan Self-Immolations

Ai Weiwei Album

Protests in Xinjiang

Corruption Policy
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect

Censorship Difference (Pro − Anti)

-0.5 0.0 0.5 1.0

Panxu Protest
Ai Weiwei Album
Corruption Policy
Tibetan Self-Immolations
Protests in Xinjiang
Eliminate Golden Week
Yellow Light Fines
Rental Tax
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect

Censorship Difference (Pro - Anti)

Panxu Protest
Ai Weiwei Album
Corruption Policy
Tibetan Self-Immolations
Protests in Xinjiang
Eliminate Golden Week
Yellow Light Fines
Rent Tax
Stock Market Crash

24/28
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect

Censorship Difference (Pro − Anti)
Posts For v. Against Government: Zero Causal Effect
Collective Action Events: Large Causal Effect
Collective Action Events: Large Causal Effect
Collective Action Events: Large Causal Effect

Censorship Difference (CA Event − Non-CA Event)

Panxu Protest
Collective Action Events: Large Causal Effect
Collective Action Events: Large Causal Effect

Censorship Difference (CA Event − Non-CA Event)

Panxu Protest
Tibetan Self-Immolations

Censorship Difference (CA Event − Non-CA Event)
Collective Action Events: Large Causal Effect

![Chart showing the Censorship Difference (CA Event - Non-CA Event) for Panxu Protest, Tibetan Self-Immolations, and Ai Weiwei Album.](chart.png)
Collective Action Events: Large Causal Effect
Evading Automated Review
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1:
Example Substitution 1:

自由
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1:

自由 “Freedom”
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1:

自由 “Freedom”

They can’t follow the conversation; our new keyword methods can!
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1:

自由   “Freedom”
目田

Example Substitution 2:

和   谐
“Harmonious [Society]” (official slogan)
河   蟹
“River crab” (irrelevant)

They can't follow the conversation; our new keyword methods can!
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1:

自由 “Freedom”
目田 “Eye field”
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1:

自由  "Freedom"  (censored)
目田  "Eye field"  (nonsensical)
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由 自由 “Freedom”
目 田 目田 “Eye field” (nonsensical)
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由
“Freedom”

目田
“Eye field” (nonsensical)
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由
自由
“Freedom”
“Eye field” (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2:
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1:  **Homograph**

自 由  “Freedom”  (censored)

目  田  “Eye field”  (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2:

和 谐
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由
目
“Freedom”
“Eye field” (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2:

和諧
“Harmonious [Society]” (official slogan)
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由
“Freedom”
目
“Eye field” (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2:

和谐
“Harmonious [Society]” (official slogan)
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由
自 “Freedom” (censored)
目
目田 “Eye field” (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2:

和谐
和 “Harmonious [Society]” (official slogan) (censored)
河蟹
河蟹
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由 自由
目田 “Freedom” (nonsensical)
目田 “Eye field” (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2:

和谐 和谐
河蟹 “Harmonious [Society]” (official slogan)
河蟹 “River crab”
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由 “Freedom”
目田 “Eye field” (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2:

和谐 “Harmonious [Society]” (official slogan)
河蟹 “River crab” (irrelevant)
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由
“Freedom”
目田
“Eye field” (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2: Homophone (both sound like “hexie”)

和谐
“Harmonious [Society]” (official slogan)
河蟹
“River crab” (irrelevant)
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由
自由
“Freedom”
目田
目田
“Eye field” (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2: Homophone (both sound like “hexie”)

和谐
和谐
“Harmonious [Society]” (official slogan)
河蟹
河蟹
“River crab” (irrelevant)

They can’t follow the conversation; our new keyword methods can!
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由
“Freedom”
目田
“Eye field” (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2: Homophone (both sound like “hexie”)

和谐
“Harmonious [Society]” (official slogan)
河蟹
“River crab” (irrelevant)

They can't follow the conversation; our new keyword methods can!

The same task:
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由 自由
“Freedom”
目田 目田
“Eye field” (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2: Homophone (both sound like “hexie”)

和谐 和谐
“Harmonious [Society]” (official slogan)
河蟹 河蟹
“River crab” (irrelevant)

They can’t follow the conversation; our new keyword methods can!
The same task: (1) the analyst’s job,
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由 “Freedom”
目 “Eye field” (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2: Homophone (both sound like “hexie”)

和谐 “Harmonious [Society]” (official slogan)
河蟹 “River crab” (irrelevant)

They can’t follow the conversation; our new keyword methods can!

The same task: (1) the analyst’s job, (2) language drift (#BostonBombings ~> #BostonStrong),
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由
“Freedom”
目田
“Eye field” (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2: Homophone (both sound like “hexie”)

和谐
“Harmonious [Society]” (official slogan)
河蟹
“River crab” (irrelevant)

They can’t follow the conversation; our new keyword methods can!

The same task: (1) the analyst’s job, (2) language drift (#BostonBombings ⇝ #BostonStrong), (3) People hiding in plain sight,
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由
“Freedom”
目田
“Eye field” (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2: Homophone (both sound like “hexie”)

和谐
“Harmonious [Society]” (official slogan)
河蟹
“River crab” (irrelevant)

They can’t follow the conversation; our new keyword methods can!

The same task: (1) the analyst’s job, (2) language drift (#BostonBombings ⇝ #BostonStrong), (3) People hiding in plain sight, (4) Look-alike modeling,
Evading Automated Review

Example Substitution 1: Homograph

自由
“Freedom”
目田
“Eye field” (nonsensical)

Example Substitution 2: Homophone (both sound like “hexie”)

和谐
“Harmonious [Society]” (official slogan)
河蟹
“River crab” (irrelevant)

They can’t follow the conversation; our new keyword methods can!

The same task: (1) the analyst’s job, (2) language drift
(#BostonBombings ⇝ #BostonStrong), (3) People hiding in plain sight,
(4) Look-alike modeling, (5) Starting point for sophisticated automated
text analysis
Conclusions

The Chinese people:
Individually free, Collectively in Chains

Social Media (analyzed the right way):
Enables detailed, continuous, predictive monitoring of every Chinese
government, leader, policy, dissident, scandal, company, etc.
Predicts state actions when other sources are silent
Applicable to other countries

New statistical methods widely applicable beyond China:
Following conversations when people try to evade authorities, use
language creatively, achieve political purposes, etc.
Predicting action on the ground
Understanding large volumes of text in any language
Applications to brand monitoring, government analysis, sentiment
analysis, investments, news, advertising, (maybe even Capital One!)
Conclusions

- The Chinese people:
Conclusions

- The Chinese people:
  - Individually free, Collectively in Chains
Conclusions

- The Chinese people:
  - Individually free, Collectively in Chains
- Social Media (analyzed the right way):
Conclusions

- The Chinese people:
  - Individually free, Collectively in Chains

- Social Media (analyzed the right way):
  - Enables detailed, continuous, predictive monitoring of every Chinese government, leader, policy, dissident, scandal, company, etc.
Conclusions

- The Chinese people:
  - Individually free, Collectively in Chains

- Social Media (analyzed the right way):
  - Enables detailed, continuous, predictive monitoring of every Chinese government, leader, policy, dissident, scandal, company, etc.
  - Predicts state actions when other sources are silent
Conclusions

- The Chinese people:
  - Individually free, Collectively in Chains

- Social Media (analyzed the right way):
  - Enables detailed, continuous, predictive monitoring of every Chinese government, leader, policy, dissident, scandal, company, etc.
  - Predicts state actions when other sources are silent
  - Applicable to other countries
Conclusions

- **The Chinese people:**
  - Individually free, Collectively in Chains

- **Social Media (analyzed the right way):**
  - Enables detailed, continuous, predictive monitoring of every Chinese government, leader, policy, dissident, scandal, company, etc.
  - Predicts state actions when other sources are silent
  - Applicable to other countries

- **New statistical methods widely applicable beyond China:**
Conclusions

- **The Chinese people:**
  - Individually free, Collectively in Chains

- **Social Media (analyzed the right way):**
  - Enables detailed, continuous, predictive monitoring of every Chinese government, leader, policy, dissident, scandal, company, etc.
  - Predicts state actions when other sources are silent
  - Applicable to other countries

- **New statistical methods widely applicable beyond China:**
  - Following conversations when people try to evade authorities, use language creatively, achieve political purposes, etc.
Conclusions

- **The Chinese people:**
  - Individually free, Collectively in Chains

- **Social Media (analyzed the right way):**
  - Enables detailed, continuous, predictive monitoring of every Chinese government, leader, policy, dissident, scandal, company, etc.
  - Predicts state actions when other sources are silent
  - Applicable to other countries

- **New statistical methods widely applicable beyond China:**
  - Following conversations when people try to evade authorities, use language creatively, achieve political purposes, etc.
  - Predicting action on the ground
Conclusions

- The Chinese people:
  - Individually free, Collectively in Chains

- Social Media (analyzed the right way):
  - Enables detailed, continuous, predictive monitoring of every Chinese government, leader, policy, dissident, scandal, company, etc.
  - Predicts state actions when other sources are silent
  - Applicable to other countries

- New statistical methods widely applicable beyond China:
  - Following conversations when people try to evade authorities, use language creatively, achieve political purposes, etc.
  - Predicting action on the ground
  - Understanding large volumes of text in any language
Conclusions

- The Chinese people:
  - Individually free, Collectively in Chains

- Social Media (analyzed the right way):
  - Enables detailed, continuous, predictive monitoring of every Chinese government, leader, policy, dissident, scandal, company, etc.
  - Predicts state actions when other sources are silent
  - Applicable to other countries

- New statistical methods widely applicable beyond China:
  - Following conversations when people try to evade authorities, use language creatively, achieve political purposes, etc.
  - Predicting action on the ground
  - Understanding large volumes of text in any language
  - Applications to brand monitoring, government analysis, sentiment analysis, investments, news, advertising, (maybe even Capital One!)
For more information

Gary King

King@Harvard.edu
Censorship to Preempt Collective Action: Ai Weiwei’s Arrest
Censorship to Preempt Collective Action: Ai Weiwei’s Arrest

Mar. 29, 5 days prior
Apr. 3, Ai Weiwei Arrested

Actual % censorship
Predicted % censorship trend based on 3/19–3/29 data
Censorship to Preempt Collective Action: Ai Weiwei’s Arrest

Mar. 29, 5 days prior

Apr. 3, Ai Weiwei Arrested

Actual % censorship

Predicted % censorship trend based on 3/19–3/29 data

Placebo Test:
Censorship to Preempt Collective Action: Ai Weiwei’s Arrest

Mar. 29, 5 days prior
Apr. 3, Ai Weiwei Arrested

% of Posts Censored

Actual % censorship
Predicted % censorship trend based on 3/19−3/29 data

Placebo Test: Most extreme of all effects
Predicting the South China Sea Peace Agreement
Predicting the South China Sea Peace Agreement

Jun. 20, 5 days prior

Jun. 25, Peace Agreement

Predicted % censor trend based on 6/10–6/20 data

Actual % censorship

% of Posts Censored

Jun 12 Jun 22 Jul 02

Jun 12 Jun 22 2011

0.0 0.1 0.2 0.3 0.4 0.5 0.6 0.7
Predicting the South China Sea Peace Agreement

Jun. 20, 5 days prior
Jun. 25, Peace Agreement

Predicted % censorship trend based on 6/10–6/20 data

Actual % censorship

Placebo Test:
Predicting the South China Sea Peace Agreement

Jun. 20, 5 days prior
Jun. 25, Peace Agreement

Predicted % censor trend based on 6/10–6/20 data

Actual % censorship

Placebo Test: Most extreme of all effects
Censorship Pre-empting Collective Action: Wang Lijun’s Demotion
Censorship Pre-empting Collective Action: Wang Lijun’s Demotion

Jan. 28, 5 days prior
Feb. 2, Wang Lijun demoted

Actual % censorship
Predicted % censorship trend based on 1/18–1/28 data
Censorship Pre-empting Collective Action: Wang Lijun’s Demotion

Jan. 28, 5 days prior
Feb. 2, Wang Lijun demoted

Actual % censorship

Predicted % censorship trend based on 1/18–1/28 data

Placebo Test:

Most extreme of all effects
Censorship Pre-empting Collective Action: Wang Lijun’s Demotion

Placebo Test: Most extreme of all effects
Uncensored Posts (w/o Collective Action Potential)
Critical of the State
Uncensored Posts (w/o Collective Action Potential)

Critical of the State

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Collective Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yes</td>
<td>CENSORED</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>no</td>
<td>Free</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>no</td>
<td>Free</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

State Critique
Uncensored Posts (w/o Collective Action Potential)
Critical of the State

This is a city government [Yulin City, Shaanxi] that treats life with contempt, this is government officials run amuck, a city government without justice, a city government that delights in that which is vulgar, a place where officials all have mistresses, a city government that is shameless with greed, a government that trades dignity for power, a government without humanity, a government that has no limits on immorality, a government that goes back on its word, a government that treats kindness with ingratitude, a government that cares nothing for posterity...
Censored Post (with Collective Action Potential)
Supporting the State
Censored Post (with Collective Action Potential)
Supporting the State

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State Critique</th>
<th>Collective Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>yes</td>
<td>Free</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>no</td>
<td>Free</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yes</td>
<td>Censored</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>no</td>
<td>Censored</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Censored Post (with Collective Action Potential)
Supporting the State

The bombing led not only to the tragedy of his death but the death of many government workers. Even if we can verify what Qian Mingqi said on Weibo that the building demolition caused a great deal of personal damage, we should still condemn his extreme act of retribution. . . . The government has continually put forth measures and laws to protect the interests of citizens in building demolition. And the media has called attention to the plight of those experiencing housing demolition. The rate at which compensation for housing demolition has increased exceeds inflation. In many places, this compensation can change the fate of an entire family.