

A Hard Unsolved Problem? Post-Treatment Bias in Big Social Science Questions

Gary King

Institute for Quantitative Social Science
Harvard University

Talk at the “Hard Problems in Social Science” Symposium,
Harvard University 4/10/2010

A Few Big Social Science Questions We Can't Answer

A Few Big Social Science Questions We Can't Answer

- Does democratization reduce international conflict?

A Few Big Social Science Questions We Can't Answer

- Does democratization reduce international conflict?
- Does ethnic diversity in developing countries cause civil war?

A Few Big Social Science Questions We Can't Answer

- Does democratization reduce international conflict?
- Does ethnic diversity in developing countries cause civil war?
- Does trade openness reduce the risk of state failure?

A Few Big Social Science Questions We Can't Answer

- Does democratization reduce international conflict?
- Does ethnic diversity in developing countries cause civil war?
- Does trade openness reduce the risk of state failure?
- Do strong international institutions lead to or result from international cooperation?

A Few Big Social Science Questions We Can't Answer

- Does democratization reduce international conflict?
- Does ethnic diversity in developing countries cause civil war?
- Does trade openness reduce the risk of state failure?
- Do strong international institutions lead to or result from international cooperation?
- How to distinguish between (1) the effect of your health on others and (2) the effect of interventions to improve your health on others?

A Few Big Social Science Questions We Can't Answer

- Does democratization reduce international conflict?
- Does ethnic diversity in developing countries cause civil war?
- Does trade openness reduce the risk of state failure?
- Do strong international institutions lead to or result from international cooperation?
- How to distinguish between (1) the effect of your health on others and (2) the effect of interventions to improve your health on others?
- Is individual student achievement caused by (1) students' socioeconomic characteristics or (2) their peers' average achievement? (I.e., does tutoring a subgroup help others and then feedback?)

A Few Big Social Science Questions We Can't Answer

- Does democratization reduce international conflict?
- Does ethnic diversity in developing countries cause civil war?
- Does trade openness reduce the risk of state failure?
- Do strong international institutions lead to or result from international cooperation?
- How to distinguish between (1) the effect of your health on others and (2) the effect of interventions to improve your health on others?
- Is individual student achievement caused by (1) students' socioeconomic characteristics or (2) their peers' average achievement? (I.e., does tutoring a subgroup help others and then feedback?)
- Thousands of other examples in most areas of the social sciences.

Experiments are terrific, but that's not the issue

Experiments are terrific, but that's not the issue

- Experimental research: requires **random treatment assignment**

Experiments are terrific, but that's not the issue

- Experimental research: requires **random treatment assignment**
- (Perhaps the most important methodological idea in the last century)

Experiments are terrific, but that's not the issue

- Experimental research: requires **random treatment assignment**
- (Perhaps the most important methodological idea in the last century)
- Random assignment: occasionally possible

Experiments are terrific, but that's not the issue

- Experimental research: requires **random treatment assignment**
- (Perhaps the most important methodological idea in the last century)
- Random assignment: occasionally possible, usually not

Experiments are terrific, but that's not the issue

- Experimental research: requires **random treatment assignment**
- (Perhaps the most important methodological idea in the last century)
- Random assignment: occasionally possible, usually not
 - The vast majority of research is observational


Experiments are terrific, but that's not the issue

- Experimental research: requires **random treatment assignment**
- (Perhaps the most important methodological idea in the last century)
- Random assignment: occasionally possible, usually not
 - The vast majority of research is observational
 - The vast majority of knowledge learned is from observation

Experiments are terrific, but that's not the issue

- Experimental research: requires **random treatment assignment**
- (Perhaps the most important methodological idea in the last century)
- Random assignment: occasionally possible, usually not
 - The vast majority of research is observational
 - The vast majority of knowledge learned is from observation
 - Most knowledge learned *from experiments* is observational

Experiments are terrific, but that's not the issue

- Experimental research: requires **random treatment assignment**
- (Perhaps the most important methodological idea in the last century)
- Random assignment: occasionally possible, usually not
 - The vast majority of research is observational
 - The vast majority of knowledge learned is from observation
 - Most knowledge learned *from experiments* is observational
-  So yes

Experiments are terrific, but that's not the issue

- Experimental research: requires **random treatment assignment**
- (Perhaps the most important methodological idea in the last century)
- Random assignment: occasionally possible, usually not
 - The vast majority of research is observational
 - The vast majority of knowledge learned is from observation
 - Most knowledge learned *from experiments* is observational
- \rightsquigarrow So yes
 - experiments are terrific

Experiments are terrific, but that's not the issue

- Experimental research: requires **random treatment assignment**
- (Perhaps the most important methodological idea in the last century)
- Random assignment: occasionally possible, usually not
 - The vast majority of research is observational
 - The vast majority of knowledge learned is from observation
 - Most knowledge learned *from experiments* is observational
- \rightsquigarrow So yes
 - experiments are terrific
 - we can't run them that often

Experiments are terrific, but that's not the issue

- Experimental research: requires **random treatment assignment**
- (Perhaps the most important methodological idea in the last century)
- Random assignment: occasionally possible, usually not
 - The vast majority of research is observational
 - The vast majority of knowledge learned is from observation
 - Most knowledge learned *from experiments* is observational
- \rightsquigarrow So yes
 - experiments are terrific
 - we can't run them that often
 - but we can often learn plenty without experiments

Progress in Causal Inference

Progress in Causal Inference

- **Inference:** using facts you have to learn about facts you don't have

Progress in Causal Inference

- **Inference:** using facts you have to learn about facts you don't have
- **Causal effect:** Your outcome with the treatment minus your outcome if you had not received the treatment

Progress in Causal Inference

- **Inference:** using facts you have to learn about facts you don't have
- **Causal effect:** Your outcome with the treatment minus your outcome if you had not received the treatment
- **Causal inference:** estimating the causal effect

Progress in Causal Inference

- **Inference:** using facts you have to learn about facts you don't have
- **Causal effect:** Your outcome with the treatment minus your outcome if you had not received the treatment
- **Causal inference:** estimating the causal effect
 - Get equivalent treatment and control groups

Progress in Causal Inference

- **Inference:** using facts you have to learn about facts you don't have
- **Causal effect:** Your outcome with the treatment minus your outcome if you had not received the treatment
- **Causal inference:** estimating the causal effect
 - Get equivalent treatment and control groups
 - Apply or observe the treatment

Progress in Causal Inference

- **Inference:** using facts you have to learn about facts you don't have
- **Causal effect:** Your outcome with the treatment minus your outcome if you had not received the treatment
- **Causal inference:** estimating the causal effect
 - Get equivalent treatment and control groups
 - Apply or observe the treatment
 - $\text{average}(\text{outcome for treateds}) - \text{average}(\text{outcome for controls})$

Progress in Causal Inference

- **Inference:** using facts you have to learn about facts you don't have
- **Causal effect:** Your outcome with the treatment minus your outcome if you had not received the treatment
- **Causal inference:** estimating the causal effect
 - Get equivalent treatment and control groups
 - Apply or observe the treatment
 - $\text{average}(\text{outcome for treateds}) - \text{average}(\text{outcome for controls})$
- Biggest problem we know about: **Omitted variable bias**

Progress in Causal Inference

- **Inference:** using facts you have to learn about facts you don't have
- **Causal effect:** Your outcome with the treatment minus your outcome if you had not received the treatment
- **Causal inference:** estimating the causal effect
 - Get equivalent treatment and control groups
 - Apply or observe the treatment
 - $\text{average}(\text{outcome for treated}) - \text{average}(\text{outcome for controls})$
- Biggest problem we know about: **Omitted variable bias**
 - What if those who get the medicine are healthier than those who don't?

Progress in Causal Inference

- **Inference:** using facts you have to learn about facts you don't have
- **Causal effect:** Your outcome with the treatment minus your outcome if you had not received the treatment
- **Causal inference:** estimating the causal effect
 - Get equivalent treatment and control groups
 - Apply or observe the treatment
 - $\text{average}(\text{outcome for treated}) - \text{average}(\text{outcome for controls})$
- Biggest problem we know about: **Omitted variable bias**
 - What if those who get the medicine are healthier than those who don't?
 - What if those who participate in a job training program are less educated?

Progress in Causal Inference

- **Inference:** using facts you have to learn about facts you don't have
- **Causal effect:** Your outcome with the treatment minus your outcome if you had not received the treatment
- **Causal inference:** estimating the causal effect
 - Get equivalent treatment and control groups
 - Apply or observe the treatment
 - $\text{average}(\text{outcome for treateds}) - \text{average}(\text{outcome for controls})$
- Biggest problem we know about: **Omitted variable bias**
 - What if those who get the medicine are healthier than those who don't?
 - What if those who participate in a job training program are less educated?
- **Well-known solutions to omitted variable bias:**

Progress in Causal Inference

- **Inference:** using facts you have to learn about facts you don't have
- **Causal effect:** Your outcome with the treatment minus your outcome if you had not received the treatment
- **Causal inference:** estimating the causal effect
 - Get equivalent treatment and control groups
 - Apply or observe the treatment
 - $\text{average}(\text{outcome for treateds}) - \text{average}(\text{outcome for controls})$
- Biggest problem we know about: **Omitted variable bias**
 - What if those who get the medicine are healthier than those who don't?
 - What if those who participate in a job training program are less educated?
- **Well-known solutions to omitted variable bias:**
 - Randomize treatment (all confounders are unrelated to treatment)

Progress in Causal Inference

- **Inference:** using facts you have to learn about facts you don't have
- **Causal effect:** Your outcome with the treatment minus your outcome if you had not received the treatment
- **Causal inference:** estimating the causal effect
 - Get equivalent treatment and control groups
 - Apply or observe the treatment
 - $\text{average}(\text{outcome for treateds}) - \text{average}(\text{outcome for controls})$
- Biggest problem we know about: **Omitted variable bias**
 - What if those who get the medicine are healthier than those who don't?
 - What if those who participate in a job training program are less educated?
- **Well-known solutions to omitted variable bias:**
 - Randomize treatment (all confounders are unrelated to treatment)
 - Control (physically or statistically) for the potential confounders

So What's Post-Treatment Bias?

So What's Post-Treatment Bias?

- It occurs:

So What's Post-Treatment Bias?

- It occurs:
 - when **controlling away for the consequences of treatment**

So What's Post-Treatment Bias?

- It occurs:
 - when **controlling away for the consequences of treatment**
 - when **causal ordering among predictors is ambiguous** or wrong

So What's Post-Treatment Bias?

- It occurs:
 - when **controlling away for the consequences of treatment**
 - when **causal ordering among predictors is ambiguous** or wrong
- Resulting biases can go in either direction

So What's Post-Treatment Bias?

- It occurs:
 - when **controlling away for the consequences of treatment**
 - when **causal ordering among predictors is ambiguous** or wrong
- Resulting biases can go in either direction
- The problem is obvious once you think about it

So What's Post-Treatment Bias?

- It occurs:
 - when **controlling away for the consequences of treatment**
 - when **causal ordering among predictors is ambiguous** or wrong
- Resulting biases can go in either direction
- The problem is obvious once you think about it
- For many big social science questions, we have no solution

Examples of **Avoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

Examples of **Avoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of Party ID on the Vote

Examples of **Avoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of Party ID on the Vote
 - Do control for race

Examples of **Avoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of Party ID on the Vote
 - Do control for race
 - Do not control for voting intentions five minutes before voting

Examples of **Avoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of Party ID on the Vote
 - Do control for race
 - Do not control for voting intentions five minutes before voting
- Causal effect of Race on Salary in a firm

Examples of **Avoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of Party ID on the Vote
 - Do control for race
 - Do not control for voting intentions five minutes before voting
- Causal effect of Race on Salary in a firm
 - Do control for qualifications

Examples of **Avoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of Party ID on the Vote
 - Do control for race
 - Do not control for voting intentions five minutes before voting
- Causal effect of Race on Salary in a firm
 - Do control for qualifications
 - Don't control for position in the firm

Examples of **Avoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of Party ID on the Vote
 - Do control for race
 - Do not control for voting intentions five minutes before voting
- Causal effect of Race on Salary in a firm
 - Do control for qualifications
 - Don't control for position in the firm
- Causal effect of medicine on health

Examples of **Avoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of Party ID on the Vote
 - Do control for race
 - Do not control for voting intentions five minutes before voting
- Causal effect of Race on Salary in a firm
 - Do control for qualifications
 - Don't control for position in the firm
- Causal effect of medicine on health
 - Do control for health prior to the treatment decision

Examples of **Avoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of Party ID on the Vote
 - Do control for race
 - Do not control for voting intentions five minutes before voting
- Causal effect of Race on Salary in a firm
 - Do control for qualifications
 - Don't control for position in the firm
- Causal effect of medicine on health
 - Do control for health prior to the treatment decision
 - Do not control for side effects or other medicines taken later

Examples of **Avoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of Party ID on the Vote
 - Do control for race
 - Do not control for voting intentions five minutes before voting
- Causal effect of Race on Salary in a firm
 - Do control for qualifications
 - Don't control for position in the firm
- Causal effect of medicine on health
 - Do control for health prior to the treatment decision
 - Do not control for side effects or other medicines taken later

↪ Post-treatment bias in these examples: **easy to see & avoid**

Examples of **Unavoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

Examples of **Unavoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of democratization on civil war; do we control for GDP?

Examples of **Unavoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of democratization on civil war; do we control for GDP?
 - Yes, since $\text{GDP} \rightarrow \text{democratization}$ we must control to avoid omitted variable bias

Examples of **Unavoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of democratization on civil war; do we control for GDP?
 - Yes, since $\text{GDP} \rightarrow \text{democratization}$ we must control to avoid omitted variable bias
 - No, since $\text{democratization} \rightarrow \text{GDP}$, we would have post-treatment bias

Examples of **Unavoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of democratization on civil war; do we control for GDP?
 - Yes, since $\text{GDP} \rightarrow \text{democratization}$ we must control to avoid omitted variable bias
 - No, since $\text{democratization} \rightarrow \text{GDP}$, we would have post-treatment bias
- Causal effect of legislative effectiveness on state failure; do we control for trade openness?

Examples of **Unavoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of democratization on civil war; do we control for GDP?
 - Yes, since $\text{GDP} \rightarrow \text{democratization}$ we must control to avoid omitted variable bias
 - No, since $\text{democratization} \rightarrow \text{GDP}$, we would have post-treatment bias
- Causal effect of legislative effectiveness on state failure; do we control for trade openness?
 - Yes, since $\text{trade openness} \rightarrow \text{legislative effectiveness}$, we must control to avoid omitted variable bias

Examples of Unavoidable Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of democratization on civil war; do we control for GDP?
 - Yes, since $\text{GDP} \rightarrow \text{democratization}$ we must control to avoid omitted variable bias
 - No, since $\text{democratization} \rightarrow \text{GDP}$, we would have post-treatment bias
- Causal effect of legislative effectiveness on state failure; do we control for trade openness?
 - Yes, since $\text{trade openness} \rightarrow \text{legislative effectiveness}$, we must control to avoid omitted variable bias
 - No, since $\text{legislative effectiveness} \rightarrow \text{trade openness}$, we would have post-treatment bias

Examples of **Unavoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of democratization on civil war; do we control for GDP?
 - Yes, since $\text{GDP} \rightarrow \text{democratization}$ we must control to avoid omitted variable bias
 - No, since $\text{democratization} \rightarrow \text{GDP}$, we would have post-treatment bias
- Causal effect of legislative effectiveness on state failure; do we control for trade openness?
 - Yes, since $\text{trade openness} \rightarrow \text{legislative effectiveness}$, we must control to avoid omitted variable bias
 - No, since $\text{legislative effectiveness} \rightarrow \text{trade openness}$, we would have post-treatment bias
- Causal effect of tutoring on individual test scores; do we control for average test scores?

Examples of **Unavoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of democratization on civil war; do we control for GDP?
 - Yes, since $\text{GDP} \rightarrow \text{democratization}$ we must control to avoid omitted variable bias
 - No, since $\text{democratization} \rightarrow \text{GDP}$, we would have post-treatment bias
- Causal effect of legislative effectiveness on state failure; do we control for trade openness?
 - Yes, since $\text{trade openness} \rightarrow \text{legislative effectiveness}$, we must control to avoid omitted variable bias
 - No, since $\text{legislative effectiveness} \rightarrow \text{trade openness}$, we would have post-treatment bias
- Causal effect of tutoring on individual test scores; do we control for average test scores?
 - Yes, since $\text{peers} \rightarrow \text{individual scores}$, and so must control to avoid omitted variable bias

Examples of **Unavoidable** Post-Treatment Bias

- Causal effect of democratization on civil war; do we control for GDP?
 - Yes, since $\text{GDP} \rightarrow \text{democratization}$ we must control to avoid omitted variable bias
 - No, since $\text{democratization} \rightarrow \text{GDP}$, we would have post-treatment bias
- Causal effect of legislative effectiveness on state failure; do we control for trade openness?
 - Yes, since $\text{trade openness} \rightarrow \text{legislative effectiveness}$, we must control to avoid omitted variable bias
 - No, since $\text{legislative effectiveness} \rightarrow \text{trade openness}$, we would have post-treatment bias
- Causal effect of tutoring on individual test scores; do we control for average test scores?
 - Yes, since $\text{peers} \rightarrow \text{individual scores}$, and so must control to avoid omitted variable bias
 - No, since $\text{individual scores} \rightarrow \text{averages}$, we would have post-treatment bias

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

- Is there a statistical fix?

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

- Is there a statistical fix? Nope.

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

- Is there a statistical fix? Nope.
- What about trying it both ways (include and exclude)?

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

- Is there a statistical fix? Nope.
- What about trying it both ways (include and exclude)? Nope. The estimates do not bound the truth!

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

- Is there a statistical fix? Nope.
- What about trying it both ways (include and exclude)? Nope. The estimates do not bound the truth!
- Is there identifying information in the ideal case?

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

- Is there a statistical fix? Nope.
- What about trying it both ways (include and exclude)? Nope. The estimates do not bound the truth!
- Is there identifying information in the ideal case? In many situations, no; in others we don't know.

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

- Is there a statistical fix? Nope.
- What about trying it both ways (include and exclude)? Nope. The estimates do not bound the truth!
- Is there identifying information in the ideal case? In many situations, no; in others we don't know.
- Can we redesign data collection to avoid the problem?

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

- Is there a statistical fix? Nope.
- What about trying it both ways (include and exclude)? Nope. The estimates do not bound the truth!
- Is there identifying information in the ideal case? In many situations, no; in others we don't know.
- Can we redesign data collection to avoid the problem? Usually not.

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

- Is there a statistical fix? Nope.
- What about trying it both ways (include and exclude)? Nope. The estimates do not bound the truth!
- Is there identifying information in the ideal case? In many situations, no; in others we don't know.
- Can we redesign data collection to avoid the problem? Usually not.
- Is there progress on related issues?

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

- Is there a statistical fix? Nope.
- What about trying it both ways (include and exclude)? Nope. The estimates do not bound the truth!
- Is there identifying information in the ideal case? In many situations, no; in others we don't know.
- Can we redesign data collection to avoid the problem? Usually not.
- Is there progress on related issues? See Kosuke Imai, Adam Glynn, Chuck Manski, Jamie Robins, Paul Rosenbaum, Don Rubin, Tyler VanderWeele, and others.

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

- Is there a statistical fix? Nope.
- What about trying it both ways (include and exclude)? Nope. The estimates do not bound the truth!
- Is there identifying information in the ideal case? In many situations, no; in others we don't know.
- Can we redesign data collection to avoid the problem? Usually not.
- Is there progress on related issues? See Kosuke Imai, Adam Glynn, Chuck Manski, Jamie Robins, Paul Rosenbaum, Don Rubin, Tyler VanderWeele, and others.
- Are there areas of social science scholarship not affected?

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

- Is there a statistical fix? Nope.
- What about trying it both ways (include and exclude)? Nope. The estimates do not bound the truth!
- Is there identifying information in the ideal case? In many situations, no; in others we don't know.
- Can we redesign data collection to avoid the problem? Usually not.
- Is there progress on related issues? See Kosuke Imai, Adam Glynn, Chuck Manski, Jamie Robins, Paul Rosenbaum, Don Rubin, Tyler VanderWeele, and others.
- Are there areas of social science scholarship not affected? Yes, but the bigger the question the more likely you'll find the problem

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

- Is there a statistical fix? Nope.
- What about trying it both ways (include and exclude)? Nope. The estimates do not bound the truth!
- Is there identifying information in the ideal case? In many situations, no; in others we don't know.
- Can we redesign data collection to avoid the problem? Usually not.
- Is there progress on related issues? See Kosuke Imai, Adam Glynn, Chuck Manski, Jamie Robins, Paul Rosenbaum, Don Rubin, Tyler VanderWeele, and others.
- Are there areas of social science scholarship not affected? Yes, but the bigger the question the more likely you'll find the problem
- Is there hope?

Solutions for Post-Treatment Bias?

- Is there a statistical fix? Nope.
- What about trying it both ways (include and exclude)? Nope. The estimates do not bound the truth!
- Is there identifying information in the ideal case? In many situations, no; in others we don't know.
- Can we redesign data collection to avoid the problem? Usually not.
- Is there progress on related issues? See Kosuke Imai, Adam Glynn, Chuck Manski, Jamie Robins, Paul Rosenbaum, Don Rubin, Tyler VanderWeele, and others.
- Are there areas of social science scholarship not affected? Yes, but the bigger the question the more likely you'll find the problem
- Is there hope? There's always hope; just no answers!

For more information

<http://GKing.Harvard.edu>